

REQUEST FOR BOARD ACTION

**HENDERSON COUNTY
BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS**

MEETING DATE: May 1, 2006

SUBJECT: **SOLID WASTE TRANSFER STATION 2ND BAY
RECOMMENDATION FOR AWARD OF BIDS**

ATTACHMENTS: **CDM RECOMMENDATION
BID SUMMARY
BID TABULATION**

SUMMARY OF REQUEST: Bids have been received on the 2nd bay of the Transfer Station and repairs to the existing Transfer Station. The low bid for the project was from Construction Logic at \$1,670,555.25. The engineer's estimate for the project was as follows:

Transfer Station 2 nd Bay	\$1,195,888
1 st Bay Restoration	\$ 250,321
Engineering Services	\$ 116,600
Total Project Estimate	\$1,562,809

Staff is reviewing the low bid with the contractor to determine if costs can be reduced or eliminated.

Construction administration services will be provided by the County Engineer at an estimated savings of \$50,000 to \$75,000.

Staff is recommending that the project be awarded to Construction Logic and that staff negotiate a contract. The County Engineer will be present to discuss this matter with the Board of Commissioners.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION/ACTION REQUIRED:

Recommend the project be awarded to Construction Logic and that staff negotiate a contract.

April 14, 2006

Mr. Gary Tweed, P.E.
Henderson County Engineer
802 Stoney Mountain Road
Hendersonville, North Carolina 28791

Subject: Bid Evaluation and Recommendation
Henderson County Municipal Solid Waste Transfer Station – Phase II
Henderson County, North Carolina

Dear Mr. Tweed:

Bids were received for the above referenced project on Wednesday, April 5, 2006. A total of three (3) bids were received and opened. This letter presents CDM's evaluation of the bids that were received and our recommendation for award. The certified bid tabulation is attached for your reference.

Evaluation of Bids

Three (3) bids were received and opened. CDM evaluated each bid based on whether the Contractor submitted all information as required by the Project Specifications. A matrix is attached as **Exhibit 1** to this letter showing all bidders, the information required in the bid, and a summary of the bid amounts. In addition, each bid was also reviewed for mathematical errors and other discrepancies. The certified bid tabulations the Total Base Bid are presented in **Exhibit 2**. The bids are also summarized below, from low to high:

1.	Construction Logic, Inc.	\$ 1,670,975.25
2.	Langston Construction Company, Inc.	\$ 1,800,893.00
3.	Cooper Construction Company, Inc.	\$ 1,945,890.00

Deficiencies and issues identified during CDM's review of the submitted bids, in addition to general comments, are summarized below:

Mr. Gary Tweed
April 14, 2006
Page 2

Construction Logic, Inc.

■ Section 00300 – Bid Form

1. Unit Prices were not provided for Item Nos. 9, 16 and 17. In addition, a mathematical error was found in their bid for Item No. 18 (indicated Amount was \$400 too low), which has in turn affected the overall Total Bid Amount.
2. Subcontractors and/or Suppliers were not listed on Page 00300-6 of Section 00300, Bid Form. However, based on information provided in their Attachment “A” qualification forms, it appears that Construction Logic will be subcontracting the pre-engineered metal building to DWS Structures, Inc.

■ Section 00420 – Qualifications Form

3. Part 2.0, License. Expiration date of Contractor’s License was not provided.
4. Part 3.0, Experience. The average annual amount of construction work performed over the past five years was requested. Since the company was incorporated in 2003, only three years of information was provided.
5. Part 5.3, Financial Information. A certified Dunn & Bradstreet rating of the organization was not provided.
6. Part 6.0, Safety. Insurance Interstate Experience Modification Rate (EMR) was not provided for the three most recent years.
7. Attachment “A”, Project Experience. Based on submitted attachments, Construction Logic has been involved with building construction and renovations, but has not identified any projects involving pre-engineered buildings. Additional attachments were provided in their bid submittal for DWS Structures, Inc. Those projects indicate experience with pre-engineered metal buildings.

■ Section 00485 – Authority to Execute Contract

8. A copy of the Articles of Incorporation was provided for Construction Logic. A copy of the corporate resolutions of the board of directors authorizing an officer to execute the Agreement on behalf of the corporation was not provided.

Mr. Gary Tweed
April 14, 2006
Page 3

Langston Construction Company, Inc.

■ Section 00300 – Bid Form

1. The Unit Price indicated for Item No. 23 appears to be a typographical error. It is assumed that the Unit Price was intended to be \$2.40 per yd² and not \$2,400 per yd² as shown.
2. Subcontractors and/or Suppliers were not listed on Page 00300-6 of Section 00300, Bid Form.

■ Section 00420 – Qualifications Form

3. Part 5.3, Financial Information. A certified Dunn & Bradstreet rating of the organization was not provided.
4. Attachment “A”, Project Experience. A list of commercial/industrial projects was provided in lieu of Attachment “A”. The list does not contain information indicating if pre-engineered buildings were part of the projects.

Cooper Construction Company, Inc.

■ Section 00420 – Qualification Form

1. The Qualification Form contained in the project specifications was not submitted as part of the bid submittal. In its place, AIA Document A305-1986 was submitted. In general, the document contains the information requested in the Qualification Form with the exception of the items noted below.
2. Expiration date of Contractor’s License was not provided.
3. Average annual amount of construction work performed during the past five years was not provided.
4. A certified Dunn & Bradstreet rating of the organization was not provided.
5. Safety information, such as Insurance Interstate Experience Modification Rate (EMR), was not provided for the three most recent years.

Mr. Gary Tweed
April 14, 2006
Page 4

6. A list was provided that identifies projects which are in progress and/or have been completed within the last 5 years. The list does not contain information indicating if pre-engineered buildings were part of the projects.

Reference Checks

Construction Logic, Inc.

Several of the references indicated on Construction Logics' Attachment "A" qualification forms were contacted by CDM to inquire about their experiences with Construction Logic, Inc. and their proposed building subcontractor, DWS Structures, Inc.

During this process, CDM spoke with Mr. Ed Ellis (State of North Carolina – Blue Ridge Community College) and Mr. William Stamey (Town of Canton) regarding Construction Logic. Construction Logic has done multiple projects for each of the references which have usually involved renovations and/or building expansions. In general, they indicated that Construction Logic has been good, responsive and cooperative with requests, and no significant problems with budget or schedule were encountered. Mr. Stamey also stated that he would recommend using them.

Mr. Kevin Humphries (Suit Development) and Mr. Melvin Nelson (Osborne Construction) were contacted regarding DWS Structures, Inc. Both references indicated that they have used DWS Structures on several projects involving pre-engineered buildings and have not had any problems with budget, schedule, or overall product. Mr. Humphries gave DWS Structures a "thumbs up".

Langston Construction Company, Inc.

The previous project history provided by Langston Construction did contain sufficient contact information to perform reference checks. If the County anticipates that Construction Logic's bid may be rejected and that they would like to consider Langston Construction for this project, CDM will contact them for more information and perform references checks.

Cooper Construction Company, Inc.

Cooper Construction provided numerous reference letters with their bid submittal. No issues or potential problems were noted in the review of the letters. CDM did not contact any of the references for additional information. If the County would like to pursue Cooper Construction, CDM will perform a more in depth reference check.

Mr. Gary Tweed
April 14, 2006
Page 5

Recommendation

Based on the information provided and our review of references, it appears that Construction Logic, along with their subcontractor DWS Structures, is capable of performing the work associated with the Phase II Solid Waste Transfer Station. Therefore, CDM recommends the contract be awarded to Construction Logic as a qualified bidder provided that they address all issues and deficiencies listed to the satisfaction of Henderson County.

Our recommendation is contingent upon the County's determination that Construction Logic is in compliance with the "Minority Business Plan Minimum Compliance Requirements" as set forth in the Project Specifications and as determined by your Office of Minority Affairs, and that the County has no questions or comments regarding the information provided herein.

Closure

CDM appreciates the opportunity to continue to assist Henderson County. If you have questions or need any additional information, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Very truly yours,

Peter M. Chenevey, P.E.
Project Engineer
Camp Dresser & McKee

Attachments: Exhibit 1 - Bid Summary
Exhibit 2 - Bid Tabulation

cc: Mr. Tim Grant (CDM)
Mr. James Forehand (CDM)

Exhibit 1 - Bid Summary
HENDERSON COUNTY MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE TRANSFER STATION - PHASE II
HENDERSON COUNTY, NORTH CAROLINA

Contractor	Contractor License Number	Addendum Nos. 1 to 3	Bid Form (Section 00300)	Bid Bond (Section 00410)	Qualification Form (Section 00420)	Non-Collusive Affidavit (Section 00480)	Authority to Execute Contract (Section 00485)
<i>Construction Logic, Inc.</i> 475 S. Church Street, Suite 800 Hendersonville, NC 28792	53583	X	\$ 1,670,975.25 (See Notes 1,2)	X	X (See Note 2)	X	(See Note 3)
<i>Langston Construction Company, Inc.</i> 125 Langston Road Piedmont, SC 29673	24596	X	\$ 1,800,893.00 (See Note 2)	X	X (See Note 2)	X	X
<i>Cooper Construction Company, Inc.</i> P.O. Box 806, Hendersonville, NC 28793 761 S. Allen Road, Flat Rock, NC 28731	4763	X	\$ 1,945,890.00	X	X (See Note 2)	X	X

Bid Evaluation Notes:

1. The Total Bid Amount for Construction Logic, Inc. reflects an adjustment for a \$400 mathematical error found in Item No. 18 of their submitted Bid Form.
2. Deficiencies or issues were noted in submittal. See Bid Evaluation Letter for description.
3. A copy of the Articles of Incorporation was provided which does not contain information pertaining to the authority to execute contracts.

Exhibit 2 - Bid Tabulation
HENDERSON COUNTY MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE TRANSFER STATION - PHASE II
HENDERSON COUNTY, NORTH CAROLINA

Item No.	Description	Quantity	Units	Construction Logic, Inc.		Langston Construction Company, Inc.		Cooper Construction Company, Inc.	
				Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
1	Clearing and Grubbing	1	LS	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 8,400.00	\$ 8,400.00	\$ 2,605.00	\$ 2,605.00
2	Demolish and Remove Existing Piping, Pavement, and Drainage Structures	1	LS	\$ 3,555.00	\$ 3,555.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 7,930.00	\$ 7,930.00
3	Excavate Soil for Transfer Station and Roads	1	LS	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 77,000.00	\$ 77,000.00	\$ 8,930.00	\$ 8,930.00
4	Excavate Rippable Rock	50	CY	\$ 24.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 152.00	\$ 7,600.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 2,500.00
5	Excavate Non-Rippable Rock	50	CY	\$ 120.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 320.00	\$ 16,000.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 5,000.00
6	Backfill Soil for Transfer Station and Roads	1	LS	\$ 46,800.00	\$ 46,800.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 55,225.00	\$ 55,225.00
7	Undercut and Stockpile Unsuitable Material from Structures and Roads and Backfill undercut Areas with Suitable soils	100	CY	\$ 32.00	\$ 3,200.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 2,500.00
8	71' x 93' Transfer Station Building	1	LS	\$ 986,400.00	\$ 986,400.00	\$1,167,522.00	\$1,167,522.00	\$1,169,650.00	\$1,169,650.00
9	Furnish and Install 7,500 psi Concrete Topping on Transfer Station Floor	600	SY	\$ 40.00 +	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 36.00	\$ 21,600.00	\$ 41.60	\$ 24,960.00
10	Furnish and Install Concrete Sidewalk, Stairs, and Bollards	1	LS	\$ 21,000.00	\$ 21,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 15,500.00	\$ 15,500.00
11	Furnish and Install 2-inch PVC Water Main	205	LF	\$ 10.00	\$ 2,050.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 5,125.00	\$ 28.40	\$ 5,822.00
12	Furnish and Install 6-inch PVC Sanitary Sewer	540	LF	\$ 30.00	\$ 16,200.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 4,860.00	\$ 34.00	\$ 18,360.00
13	Furnish and Install Trench Drains	120	LF	\$ 25.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 230.00	\$ 27,600.00	\$ 333.25	\$ 39,990.00
14	Furnish and Install Outlet Piping for Trench Drains and Downspouts Between Buildings	1	LS	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 8,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00
15	Furnish and Install Solid Cover Concrete Junction Box	1	LS	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 1,800.00	\$ 1,800.00	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 3,500.00
16	Furnish and Install Concrete Apron	550	SY	\$ 60.00 +	\$ 33,000.00	\$ 82.00	\$ 45,100.00	\$ 60.30	\$ 33,165.00
17	Furnish and Install Crushed Stone Pavement	760	SY	\$ 20.66 +	\$ 15,700.00	\$ 20.00	\$ 15,200.00	\$ 18.35	\$ 13,946.00
18	Furnish and Install Bituminous Concrete Pavement	580	SY	\$ 55.00	\$ 31,900.00 *	\$ 46.00	\$ 26,680.00	\$ 59.70	\$ 34,626.00
19	Remove Existing Phase 1 Transfer Station Concrete Topping and Install 7,500 psi Concrete Topping on Transfer Station Floor	430	SY	\$ 170.00	\$ 73,100.00	\$ 185.00	\$ 79,550.00	\$ 367.10	\$ 157,853.00
20	Resurface Existing Phase 1 Transfer Station Push Walls and Increase Height by 2-foot	1	LS	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 45,000.00	\$ 45,000.00	\$ 165,760.00	\$ 165,760.00

Exhibit 2 - Bid Tabulation
HENDERSON COUNTY MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE TRANSFER STATION - PHASE II
HENDERSON COUNTY, NORTH CAROLINA

Item No.	Description	Quantity	Units	Construction Logic, Inc.		Langston Construction Company, Inc.		Cooper Construction Company, Inc.	
				Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount	Unit Price	Amount
21	Furnish and Install Modifications to Phase 1 Transfer Station Tunnel	1	LS	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 46,000.00	\$ 46,000.00	\$ 42,140.00	\$ 42,140.00
22	Furnish and Install New Covers for Phase 1 Transfer Station Push Wall Openings	1	LS	\$ 67,800.00	\$ 67,800.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 3,725.00	\$ 3,725.00
23	Seeding & Mulching	1,000	SY	\$ 7.50	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 2.40 #	\$ 2,400.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 4,000.00
24	Temporary Sedimentation and Erosion Control	1	LS	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 6,200.00	\$ 6,200.00	\$ 1,416.00	\$ 1,416.00
25	Bonds, Mobilization, and Insurance	1	LS	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 46,000.00	\$ 46,000.00	\$ 21,125.00	\$ 21,125.00
26	Indemnification	1	LS	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00
SUBTOTAL (Items 1-26)					\$1,591,405.00 **		\$1,715,137.00		\$1,853,228.00
27	Contingency (5%)	1	LS	\$ 79,570.25 **	\$ 79,570.25	\$ 85,756.00	\$ 85,756.00	\$ 92,662.00	\$ 92,662.00
TOTAL BID (Items 1-27)					\$1,670,975.25 **		\$1,800,893.00		\$1,945,890.00

Bid Tabulation Notes:

- + Unit Price was not provided on Bid Form. The shaded Unit Price shown was computed by dividing Amount indicated on Bid Form by the Quantity.
- * Amount provided on Bid Form was \$31,500. Shaded Amount shown corresponds to multiplying the Unit Price indicated on Bid Form by the Quantity.
- ** The shaded Subtotal, Contingency, and Total Amounts shown have been revised to account for the \$400 adjustment to Item 18 in the Bid Form.
- # The Unit Price provided on the Bid Form was \$2,400. Since the Amount indicated on the Bid Form was \$2,400, it is assumed that the Unit Price was meant to be \$2.40 and that the value entered is a typographical error.

BID TABULATION WAS PREPARED BY ME OR UNDER MY DIRECT SUPERVISION.

Peter M. Chenevey, P.E.